Methodology

This Pew Research Center study used digital news articles to compile information on layoffs occurring at the highest-circulation U.S. daily newspapers and highest-traffic digital-native news outlets in 2017, 2018, 2019, 2020, and 2021.

Selecting news outlets

For each year, we examined daily newspapers and digital-native news sites with the largest audience reach in the country.

Newspapers: The daily newspapers were selected based on circulation data provided by the Alliance for Audited Media (AAM) and include all papers whose average Sunday circulations (print and digital combined) were over 50,000 in the fourth quarters of 2017-2019, and the third quarter of 2021.¹ The Wall Street Journal was then added to the list as it is one of the largest papers in the U.S. that does not report Sunday circulation to the AAM. Since newspaper audience data for 2020 was not yet available at the time of <u>the 2020 analysis</u>, the same list of newspapers in 2019 was used for 2020.

¹ Fourth quarter circulation data was not available in AAM at the time the 2021 analysis was conducted.

In 2021, 73 newspapers fell into this category:

Akron Beacon Journal Albuquerque Journal The Arizona Republic Arkansas Democrat-Gazette The Atlanta Journal-Constitution Austin American-Statesman The Baltimore Sun The Birmingham News The Boston Globe Boston Herald The Buffalo News The Charlotte Observer **Chicago Sun-Times** Chicago Tribune The Cincinnati Enquirer The Columbus Dispatch The Courier Journal (Kentucky) Daily Herald (Illinois) The Dallas Morning News Dayton Daily News Democrat and Chronicle (New York) The Denver Post The Des Moines Register **Detroit Free Press** El Nuevo Día (Puerto Rico) Fort Worth Star-Telegram **The Grand Rapids Press** Hartford Courant Honolulu Star-Advertiser Houston Chronicle The Indianapolis Star The Kansas City Star Las Vegas Review-Journal Los Angeles Times The Mercury News (California) Miami Herald/El Nuevo Herald Milwaukee Journal Sentinel

The Morning Call New York Daily News New York Post The New York Times The News & Observer (North Carolina) Newsday The Oklahoman Omaha World-Herald The Orange County Register The Oregonian **Orlando Sentinel** The Palm Beach Post The Philadelphia Inquirer The Plain Dealer The Press Democrat (California) Portland Press Herald The Post-Standard (NewYork) **Richmond Times-Dispatch** The Sacramento Bee San Antonio Express-News The San Diego Union-Tribune The San Francisco Chronicle The Seattle Times South Florida Sun-Sentinel The Spokesman-Review (Washington) The Star-Ledger (New Jersey) Star Tribune (Minnesota) St. Louis Post-Dispatch St. Paul Pioneer Press **Tampa Bay Times** The Virginian-Pilot The Wall Street Journal The Washington Post Times Union (New York) **USA** Today Wisconsin State Journal

In 2019, 86 newspapers fell into this category:

The Advocate (Louisiana) Akron Beacon Journal Albuquerque Journal Arizona Daily Star The Arizona Republic Arkansas Democrat-Gazette Asbury Park Press The Atlanta Journal-Constitution Austin American-Statesman The Baltimore Sun The Birmingham News The Blade (Toledo) The Boston Globe Boston Herald The Buffalo News The Charlotte Observer Chicago Sun-Times Chicago Tribune The Cincinnati Enquirer The Columbus Dispatch The Courier Journal (Kentucky) Daily Herald (Illinois) Daily Press (Virginia) The Dallas Morning News Dayton Daily News Democrat and Chronicle (New York) The Denver Post The Des Moines Register **Detroit Free Press** Fort Worth Star-Telegram The Fresno Bee The Grand Rapids Press Hartford Courant Honolulu Star-Advertiser The Indianapolis Star The Journal Gazette/News-Sentinel (Indiana)

New York Daily News New York Post The New York Times The News & Observer (North Carolina) Newsday The Oklahoman Omaha World-Herald The Orange County Register The Oregonian **Orlando Sentinel** The Palm Beach Post The Patriot-News (Pennsylvania) The Philadelphia Inquirer **Pioneer Press** The Plain Dealer The Post and Courier (South Carolina) The Post-Standard (New York) The Providence Journal **Reading Eagle** The Record (New Jersey) The Republican (Massachusetts) **Richmond Times-Dispatch** The Sacramento Bee San Antonio Express-News The San Diego Union-Tribune The San Francisco Chronicle The Seattle Times South Florida Sun Sentinel The Spokesman-Review (Washington) The Star-Ledger (New Jersey) Star Tribune (Minnesota) St. Louis Post-Dispatch **Tampa Bay Times** The Tennessean The Times (Indiana) The Virginian-Pilot

The Kansas City Star Las Vegas Review-Journal Lexington Herald-Leader LNP (Pennsylvania) Los Angeles Times The Mercury News (California) Miami Herald/El Nuevo Herald Milwaukee Journal Sentinel The Morning Call The Wall Street Journal The Washington Post Times Union (New York) USA Today Wisconsin State Journal In 2018, 97 newspapers fell into this category:

The Advocate (Louisiana) Akron Beacon Journal Albuquerque Journal Arizona Daily Star The Arizona Republic Arkansas Democrat-Gazette Asbury Park Press The Atlanta Journal-Constitution Austin American-Statesman The Baltimore Sun The Birmingham News The Boston Globe **Boston Herald** The Buffalo News The Charlotte Observer Charlotte Sun (Florida) Chicago Sun-Times Chicago Tribune The Cincinnati Enquirer The Columbus Dispatch The Commercial Appeal (Tennessee) The Courier Journal (Kentucky) Daily Herald (Illinois) Daily News (New York) Daily Press (Virginia) The Dallas Morning News Dayton Daily News The Denver Post The Des Moines Register **Detroit Free Press** El Nuevo Día (Puerto Rico) The Florida Times-Union Fort Worth Star-Telegram The Fresno Bee The Grand Rapids Press Honolulu Star-Advertiser

New York Post The New York Times The News & Observer (North Carolina) Newsday The Oklahoman Omaha World-Herald The Orange County Register The Oregonian **Orlando Sentinel** The Palm Beach Post The Patriot-News (Pennsylvania) The Philadelphia Inquirer **Pioneer Press** Pittsburgh Post-Gazette The Plain Dealer The Post and Courier (South Carolina) The Post-Standard (New York) The Press Democrat (California) The Providence Journal **Reading Eagle** The Record (New Jersey) The Republican (Massachusetts) **Richmond Times-Dispatch** Democrat and Chronicle (New York) The Sacramento Bee San Antonio Express-News The San Diego Union-Tribune The San Francisco Chronicle Sarasota Herald-Tribune The Seattle Times South Florida Sun Sentinel The Spokesman-Review (Washington) The Star-Ledger (New Jersey) Star Tribune (Minnesota) The State (South Carolina) St. Louis Post-Dispatch

Houston Chronicle The Indianapolis Star The Journal Gazette/News-Sentinel (Indiana) The Kansas City Star Knoxville News Sentinel Las Vegas Review-Journal Lexington Herald-Leader Lincoln Journal Star LNP (Pennsylvania) Los Angeles Times The Mercury News (California) Miami Herald/El Nuevo Herald Milwaukee Journal Sentinel Tampa Bay Times The Tennessean The Times (Indiana) The Times-Picayune The Virginian-Pilot The Wall Street Journal The Washington Post Times Union (New York) Tribune-Review (Pennsylvania) Tulsa World USA Today Wisconsin State Journal In 2017, 110 newspapers fell into this category:

The Advocate (Louisiana) Akron Beacon Journal Albuquerque Journal Arizona Daily Star The Arizona Republic Arkansas Democrat-Gazette Asbury Park Press The Atlanta Journal-Constitution Austin American-Statesman The Baltimore Sun The Birmingham News The Blade (Ohio) The Boston Globe Boston Herald The Buffalo News The Canton Repository The Charlotte Observer Charlotte Sun Chattanooga Times Free Press Chicago Sun-Times Chicago Tribune The Cincinnati Enquirer The Columbus Dispatch The Commercial Appeal The Courier Journal The Daily Gazette (New York) Daily Herald (Illinois) Daily News (New York) Daily Press (Virginia) The Dallas Morning News **Dayton Daily News** The Daytona Beach News-Journal The Denver Post The Des Moines Register **Detroit Free Press** El Nuevo Día

Miami Herald/El Nuevo Herald Milwaukee Journal Sentinel The Morning Call New York Post The New York Times The News & Observer The News Journal (Delaware) The News Tribune (Washington) The News-Press (Florida) Newsday The Oklahoman Omaha World-Herald The Orange County Register The Oregonian **Orlando Sentinel** The Palm Beach Post The Patriot-News (Pennsylvania) The Philadelphia Inquirer **Pioneer Press** Pittsburgh Post-Gazette The Plain Dealer The Post and Courier (South Carolina) The Post-Standard (New York) The Press Democrat (California) The Press-Enterprise (California) The Providence Journal **Reading Eagle** The Record (New Jersey) The Republican (Massachusetts) **Richmond Times-Dispatch Rochester Democrat and Chronicle** The Sacramento Bee San Antonio Express-News The San Diego Union-Tribune Sarasota Herald-Tribune The Seattle Times

The Florida Times-Union The Fresno Bee The Gazette (Colorado) **The Grand Rapids Press** Hartford Courant Honolulu Star-Advertiser Houston Chronicle The Indianapolis Star The Journal Gazette/The News-Sentinel The Journal News (New York) Journal Star (Illinois) The Kansas City Star Knoxville News Sentinel Las Vegas Review-Journal Lexington Herald-Leader Lincoln Journal Star LNP Los Angeles Times The Mercury News

South Florida Sun-Sentinel The Spokesman-Review The Star-Ledger Star Tribune Star-Telegram The State (South Carolina) St. Louis Post-Dispatch The Tennessean The Times (Indiana) The Times-Picayune The Virginian-Pilot The Wall Street Journal The Washington Post The Wichita Eagle **Times Union** Tribune-Review (Pennsylvania) Tulsa World **USA** Today Wisconsin State Journal

Digital-native news outlets: Researchers used the list of digital-native news outlets originally created for Pew Research Center's examination of the <u>state of the news media</u> for the <u>digital news</u> <u>sector</u>, as follows. First, all domains from 11 Comscore categories (Business to Business, Directories/Resources, Entertainment, Games, Lifestyles, Multi-Category, News/Information, Services, Social Media, Sports and Technology) with at least 10 million average monthly unique digital visitors in the fourth quarter of the year were identified. Since digital audience data for 2020 was not yet available at the time of <u>the 2020 analysis</u>, the same list of digital-native news outlets in 2019 was used for 2020. From that set of entities, Center researchers then selected digital-native news outlets using the following criteria:

- 1. Must be "born on the web," i.e., not the website of a legacy news brand (though it may be owned by a legacy media company).
- 2. It is a publisher of original content about news, defined as current events affecting public life (can include both original reporting and commentary/analysis). Sites are judged by an assessment of the material appearing on their homepage. A review of top stories on the home page must render some evidence of original reporting, such as interviews, eyewitness accounts or referral to source documents, by a dedicated reporter/editorial staff. Sites are also judged as news publishers if they self-describe as an organization that produces news, either in the subject headers/navigation bar and/or in their "about" or advertising section through usage of terms like "news," "journalism," "covering" or "informing."
- 3. It is not entirely focused on reviews, advice, recipes or unedited raw data.
- 4. It is not primarily a user-generated or aggregated content platform (such as Medium, Reddit or Wikipedia). Branded content such as NBA.com was also excluded.

The following 34 entities met these criteria in 2021*:

247SPORTS.COM	IGN.COM
ATLANTABLACKSTAR.COM	INVERSE.COM
AXIOS.COM	INVESTOPEDIA.COM
BGR.COM	LIVESCIENCE.COM
BLEACHERREPORT.COM	MARKETWATCH.COM
BUSINESSINSIDER.COM/INSIDER.COM	PATCH.COM
BUSTLE.COM	POLITICO.COM
BUZZFEED.COM/BUZZFEEDNEWS.COM	POPCULTURE.COM
CNET.COM	POPSUGAR.COM
COMICBOOK.COM	SCREENRANT.COM
DIGITALTRENDS.COM	STYLECASTER.COM
EATER.COM	TECHRADAR.COM
ELITEDAILY.COM	THEDAILYBEAST.COM
FASTCOMPANY.COM	THEVERGE.COM
GAMESPOT.COM	TMZ.COM
HOLLYWOODLIFE.COM	TOMSGUIDE.COM
HUFFPOST.COM	VOX.COM

* Note: For the analysis, Buzzfeed.com and Buzzfeednews.com were considered one entity, as were BusinessInsider.com and Insider.com.

The following 45 entities met these criteria in 2019:

247SPORTS.COM	MARKETWATCH.COM
BGR.COM	MASHABLE.COM
BLEACHERREPORT.COM	MAXPREPS.COM
BUSINESSINSIDER.COM	MEDICALNEWSTODAY.COM
BUSTLE.COM	PATCH.COM
BUZZFEED.COM	PINKNEWS.CO.UK
BUZZFEEDNEWS.COM	POLITICO.COM
CNET.COM	POLYGON.COM
COMICBOOK.COM	POPCULTURE.COM
DIGITALTRENDS.COM	POPSUGAR.COM
EATER.COM	QZ.COM
ELITEDAILY.COM	REFINERY29.COM
GAMESPOT.COM	SCARYMOMMY.COM
GIZMODO.COM	SCREENRANT.COM
HOLLYWOODLIFE.COM	SLATE.COM
HUFFPOST.COM	SNOPES.COM
IGN.COM	TECHRADAR.COM
INVERSE.COM	THEDAILYBEAST.COM
INVESTOPEDIA.COM	THEVERGE.COM
JALOPNIK.COM	TMZ.COM
LIFEHACKER.COM	TOMSGUIDE.COM
LIVESCIENCE.COM	VOX.COM
LOOPER.COM	WEBMD.COM

* Note: For Buzzfeednews.com, researchers did not perform a separate search since any layoffs would have been captured in searches for Buzzfeed.com. For the analysis, these two entities were considered one.

The following 37 entities met these criteria in 2018:

247SPORTS.COM	INSIDER.COM
90MIN.COM	INVESTOPEDIA.COM
BGR.COM	MARKETWATCH.COM
BLEACHERREPORT.COM	MASHABLE.COM
BUSINESSINSIDER.COM	MAXPREPS.COM
BUSTLE.COM	POLITICO.COM
BUZZFEED.COM	POLYGON.COM
BUZZFEEDNEWS.COM	REFINERY29.COM
CNET.COM	SBNATION.COM
COMICBOOK.COM	SLATE.COM
DEADSPIN.COM	TECHRADAR.COM
DIGITALTRENDS.COM	THEDAILYBEAST.COM
EATER.COM	THEROOT.COM
ELITEDAILY.COM	THEVERGE.COM
ENGADGET.COM	THRILLIST.COM
GIZMODO.COM	TMZ.COM
HOLLYWOODLIFE.COM	UPROXX.COM
HUFFINGTONPOST.COM	VOX.COM
IGN.COM	

* Note: For Buzzfeednews.com, researchers did not perform a separate search since any layoffs would have been captured in searches for Buzzfeed.com. For the analysis, these two entities were considered one.

The following 35 entities met these criteria in 2017:

12UP.COM 247SPORTS.COM **BGR.COM BLEACHERREPORT.COM** BREITBART.COM BUSINESSINSIDER.COM BUSTLE.COM **BUZZFEED.COM** CNET.COM DEADSPIN.COM DIGITALTRENDS.COM EATER.COM ELITEDAILY.COM GAMESPOT.COM GIZMODO.COM HUFFINGTONPOST.COM **IBTIMES.COM** IGN.COM

INVESTOPEDIA.COM JEZEBEL.COM MASHABLE.COM MAXPREPS.COM POLITICO.COM QZ.COM **REFINERY29.COM** SBNATION.COM SLATE.COM THEDAILYBEAST.COM THEVERGE.COM THRILLIST.COM TMZ.COM TOPIX.NET UPROXX.COM UPWORTHY.COM VOX.COM

Searching for news articles citing layoffs

Researchers then sought to identify any publicly reported instances of layoffs at these news outlets. A number of steps were taken when searching for news articles mentioning layoffs. A round of searches was first conducted on Google using the following criteria:

- For each news outlet, Center researchers used the following search query: the name of the news outlet in quotations (e.g., "Chicago Tribune") and "~layoff" a Google Search feature that captures variations of the word "layoff" and related terms, including "lay off," "layoffs," "layoffs," "laid-off," and "job cuts."
- Articles were filtered by publication date, ranging from Jan. 1-Dec. 31 of each year. However, searches were conducted by fiscal quarters to better ensure that every layoff that occurred in the time period was identified.
- Researchers performed searches in Incognito mode on Google Chrome so that previous browser activity did not bias search results.
- The search for articles was limited to the first page of results.

Identifying newsroom layoffs

Center researchers were careful to include only layoffs directly impacting the news organizations' employees. For example, layoffs at a parent or holding company were excluded unless the announcement or coverage specified that the layoffs affected a given news outlet studied. Layoffs in an organization's international branch or newsroom were included unless they affected a different product within the news organization. This was done to guarantee that the analysis did not overcount layoffs, since many outlets share the same parent company. Cuts to vacant positions and terminations of employees not connected to layoffs were also excluded.

The news articles examined did not always mention the kinds of positions being eliminated, so the layoffs analyzed here may include the full range of employees at newspapers and digital-native news outlets, rather than just newsroom employees. Additionally, there may have been other reasons for the reported layoffs not covered by media accounts, and the results of the analysis are limited to the information provided by the news articles examined.

Once all instances of layoffs were recorded, researchers determined the number of people each round of layoffs affected. Many news articles gave an exact number of people who were laid off, but several gave approximations or ranges, while some gave no indication at all.

When a news article cited a range of laid-off staff, the stated minimum and maximum were recorded. For articles that provided an exact number or estimate of laid-off staff, the stated number was recorded as both the minimum and maximum. When only the maximum was mentioned (e.g., "up to 10"), the stated maximum was used and one was recorded as the minimum. Conversely, when only the minimum was mentioned (e.g., "at least 10"), the stated number was used as both the minimum and maximum. This was done to be as conservative as possible. The study relied on the estimated minimum number of layoffs for any individual outlet.