Methodology

This study used digital news articles to compile information on layoffs and buyouts occurring at the highest-circulation U.S. daily newspapers and highest-traffic digital-native news outlets in two years: 2017 and 2018.

Selecting news outlets

For each year, we examined daily newspapers and digital-native news sites with the largest audience reach in the country.

Newspapers: The daily newspapers were selected based on circulation data provided by the Alliance for Audited Media (AAM) and include all papers whose total Sunday circulations (print and digital combined) were over 50,000 in the fourth quarter of each year analyzed. The Wall Street Journal was then added to the list as it is one of the largest papers in the U.S. that does not report Sunday circulation to the AAM.

In 2018, 97 newspapers fell into this category:

The Advocate (Louisiana)

Akron Beacon Journal

Albuquerque Journal Arizona Daily Star

The Arizona Republic

Arkansas Democrat-Gazette

Asbury Park Press

The Atlanta Journal-Constitution

Austin American-Statesman

The Baltimore Sun

The Birmingham News

The Boston Globe

Boston Herald

The Buffalo News

The Charlotte Observer

Charlotte Sun (Florida)

Chicago Sun-Times

Chicago Tribune

The Cincinnati Enquirer

The Columbus Dispatch

The Commercial Appeal (Tennessee)

The Courier Journal (Kentucky)

Daily Herald (Illinois)

Daily News (New York)

Daily Press (Virginia)

The Dallas Morning News

Dayton Daily News

The Denver Post

The Des Moines Register

Detroit Free Press

El Nuevo Día (Puerto Rico)

The Florida Times-Union

Fort Worth Star-Telegram

The Fresno Bee

The Grand Rapids Press

Honolulu Star-Advertiser

Houston Chronicle

The Indianapolis Star

The Journal Gazette/News-Sentinel

(Indiana)

The Kansas City Star

Knoxville News Sentinel Las Vegas Review-Journal

Lexington Herald-Leader

Lincoln Journal Star

LNP (Pennsylvania) Los Angeles Times

The Mercury News (California) Miami Herald/El Nuevo Herald

Milwaukee Journal Sentinel

New York Post

The New York Times

The News & Observer (North Carolina)

Newsday

The Oklahoman

Omaha World-Herald

The Orange County Register

The Oregonian Orlando Sentinel The Palm Beach Post

The Patriot-News (Pennsylvania)

The Philadelphia Inquirer

Pioneer Press

Pittsburgh Post-Gazette

The Plain Dealer

The Post and Courier (South Carolina)

The Post-Standard (New York)

The Press Democrat (California)

The Providence Journal

Reading Eagle (Pennsylvania)

The Record (New Jersey)

The Republican (Massachusetts)

Richmond Times-Dispatch

Democrat and Chronicle (New York)

The Sacramento Bee

San Antonio Express-News The San Diego Union-Tribune The San Francisco Chronicle

Sarasota Herald-Tribune

The Seattle Times

South Florida Sun Sentinel

The Spokesman-Review (Washington)

The Star-Ledger (New Jersey) Star Tribune (Minnesota) The State (South Carolina)

St. Louis Post-Dispatch Tampa Bay Times

The Tennessean
The Times (Indiana)

The Times-Picayune The Virginian-Pilot

The Wall Street Journal
The Washington Post
Times Union (New York)

Tribune-Review (Pennsylvania)

Tulsa World USA Today

Wisconsin State Journal

In 2017, 110 newspapers fell into this category:

The Advocate (Louisiana)

Akron Beacon Journal

Albuquerque Journal Arizona Daily Star

The Arizona Republic

Arkansas Democrat-Gazette

Asbury Park Press

The Atlanta Journal-Constitution Austin American-Statesman

The Baltimore Sun

The Birmingham News
The Kansas City Star
The Blade (Ohio)
Knoxville News Sentinel
Las Vegas Review-Journal
Boston Herald
Lexington Herald-Leader
The Buffalo News
Lincoln Journal Star

The Canton Repository LNP

The Charlotte Observer Los Angeles Times
Charlotte Sun The Mercury News

Chattanooga Times Free Press Miami Herald/El Nuevo Herald Chicago Sun-Times Milwaukee Journal Sentinel

Chicago Tribune The Morning Call
The Cincinnati Enquirer New York Post

The Columbus Dispatch
The New York Times
The Commercial Appeal
The News & Observer

The Courier Journal The News Journal (Delaware)
The Daily Gazette (New York) The News Tribune (Washington)

Daily Herald (Illinois)

Daily News (New York)

The News Tribule (Washington Variable)

The News-Press (Florida)

Newsday

Daily Press (Virginia) The Oklahoman
The Dallas Morning News Omaha World-Herald

Dayton Daily News The Orange County Register

The Daytona Beach News-Journal

The Denver Post

The Des Moines Register

The Palm Beach Post

Detroit Free Press

The Patriot-News (Pennsylvania)

El Nuevo Día

The Philadelphia Inquirer

El Nuevo Día The Philadelphia Inquirer

The Florida Times-Union Pioneer Press

The France Res

The Fresno Bee Pittsburgh Post-Gazette
The Gazette (Colorado) The Plain Dealer

The Grand Rapids Press

The Post and Courier (South Carolina)

Hartford Courant The Post-Standard (New York)

Honolulu Star-Advertiser

Houston Chronicle

The Press Democrat (California)

The Press-Enterprise (California)

The Indianapolis Star The Providence Journal

The Journal Gazette/The News-Sentinel Reading Eagle

(Indiana) The Record (New Jersey)

The Journal News (New York) The Republican (Massachusetts)

Journal Star (Illinois) Richmond Times-Dispatch

PEW RESEARCH CENTER

Rochester Democrat and Chronicle

The Sacramento Bee

San Antonio Express-News

The San Diego Union-Tribune

Sarasota Herald-Tribune

The Seattle Times

South Florida Sun-Sentinel

The Spokesman-Review

The Star-Ledger

Star Tribune

Star-Telegram

The State (South Carolina)

St. Louis Post-Dispatch

The Tennessean

The Times (Indiana)

The Times-Picayune

The Virginian-Pilot

The Wall Street Journal

The Washington Post

The Wichita Eagle

Times Union

Tribune-Review (Pennsylvania)

Tulsa World

USA Today

Wisconsin State Journal

Digital-native news outlets: Researchers used the list of digital-native news outlets originally created for Pew Research Center's research on the <u>state of the news media</u> for the <u>Digital News sector</u>, as follows. First, all domains from 11 Comscore categories (Business to Business, Directories/Resources, Entertainment, Games, Lifestyles, Multi-Category, News/Information, Services, Social Media, Sports and Technology) with at least 10 million average monthly unique digital visitors in the fourth quarter of the year were identified. From that set of entities, they then selected digital-native news outlets using the following criteria:

- 1. Must be "born on the web," i.e., not the website of a legacy news brand (though it may be owned by a legacy media company).
- 2. It is a publisher of original content about news, defined as current events affecting public life (can include both original reporting and commentary/analysis). Sites are judged by an assessment of the material appearing on their homepage. A review of top stories on the home page must render some evidence of original reporting, such as interviews, eyewitness accounts or referral to source documents, by a dedicated reporter/editorial staff. Sites are also judged as news publishers if they self-describe as an organization that produces news, either in the subject headers/navigation bar and/or in their "about" or advertising section through usage of terms like "news," "journalism," "covering" or "informing."
- 3. It is not entirely focused on reviews, advice, recipes or unedited raw data.

4. It is not primarily a user-generated or aggregated content platform (such as Medium, Reddit or Wikipedia). Branded content such as NBA.com was also excluded.

The following 37 entities met these criteria in 2018:

247SPORTS.COM	INSIDER	.COM

90MIN.COM INVESTOPEDIA.COM BGR.COM MARKETWATCH.COM

BLEACHERREPORT.COM
BUSINESSINSIDER.COM
BUSTLE.COM
BUSTLE.COM
BUZZFEED.COM
BUZZFEEDNEWS.COM*
CNET.COM
SBNATION.COM
COMMODORY.COM

COMICBOOK.COM SLATE.COM

DEADSPIN.COM TECHRADAR.COM

DIGITALTRENDS.COM THEDAILYBEAST.COM

EATER.COM THEROOT.COM
ELITEDAILY.COM THEVERGE.COM
ENGADGET.COM THRILLIST.COM

GIZMODO.COM TMZ.COM
HOLLYWOODLIFE.COM UPROXX.COM
HUFFINGTONPOST.COM VOX.COM

IGN.COM

*Note: For Buzzfeednews.com researchers did not perform a separate search since any layoffs or buyouts would have been captured in searches for Buzzfeed.com. For the analysis, these two entities were considered one.

The following 35 entities met these criteria in 2017 (see methodology for how these entities were selected):

12UP.COM BUSTLE.COM 247SPORTS.COM BUZZFEED.COM BGR.COM CNET.COM

BLEACHERREPORT.COM DEADSPIN.COM

BREITBART.COM DIGITALTRENDS.COM

BUSINESSINSIDER.COM EATER.COM

ELITEDAILY.COM REFINERY29.COM
GAMESPOT.COM SBNATION.COM
GIZMODO.COM SLATE.COM

HUFFINGTONPOST.COM THEDAILYBEAST.COM

IBTIMES.COM THEVERGE.COM IGN.COM THRILLIST.COM

INVESTOPEDIA.COM TMZ.COM

JEZEBEL.COM TOPIX.NET

MASHABLE.COM UPROXX.COM

MAXPREPS.COM UPWORTHY.COM

POLITICO.COM VOX.COM

QZ.COM

Overlap: When both the 2017 and 2018 groups are combined, the analysis included 156 outlets (excluding duplicates). Overall, 78% of all news outlets studied appeared in both years, including 85% of newspapers and 61% of digital-native news sites.

Searching for news articles citing layoffs

Researchers then sought to identify any publicly reported instances of layoffs at these news outlets. A number of steps were taken when searching for news articles mentioning layoffs. A round of searches was first conducted on Google using the following criteria:

- For each news outlet, researchers used the following search query: the name of the news outlet in quotations (e.g., "Chicago Tribune") and "~layoff" a Google Search feature that captures variations of the word "layoff" and related terms, including "lay off", "layoffs", "lay-offs", "laid off", "laid-off", and "job cuts".
- Articles were filtered by publication date, ranging from Jan. 1 to Dec. 31 of each year. However, searches were conducted by fiscal quarters to better ensure that every layoff that occurred in the time period was identified.
- Researchers performed searches in Incognito mode on Google Chrome so that previous browser activity did not bias search results.
- The search for articles was limited to the first page of results.

Researchers separately searched for news articles on Mediagazer, an aggregator site for media news. This additional search was done as a check on the Google searches.

Buyouts: Separately, researchers sought to identify any publicly reported instances of buyouts at these news outlets, using the same method. As with layoffs, a round of searches was first conducted on Google news using the "~buyouts" search term, which captured variants and related terms (e.g., "buy outs"). Researchers also searched for news articles about buyouts on Mediagazer as a check on the Google searches.

Identifying newsroom layoffs

Researchers were careful to include only layoffs directly impacting the news organizations' employees. For example, layoffs at a parent or holding company were excluded unless the announcement or coverage specified that the layoffs affected a given news outlet studied. Layoffs in an organization's international branch or newsroom were included unless they affected a different product within the news organization. This was done to guarantee that the analysis did not overcount layoffs, since many outlets share the same parent company. Cuts to vacant positions and terminations of employees not connected to layoffs were also excluded. Mentions of buyouts that were offered or taken were counted and recorded separately, using the same approach.

The news articles examined did not always mention the kinds of positions being eliminated, so the layoffs analyzed here may include the full range of employees at newspapers and digital-native news outlets, rather than just newsroom employees. Additionally, there may have been other reasons for the reported layoffs not covered by media accounts, and the results of the analysis are limited to the information provided by the news articles examined.

Once all instances of layoffs were recorded, researchers determined the number of people each round of layoffs affected. Many news articles gave an exact number of people who were laid off, but several gave approximations or ranges, while some gave no indication at all.

When a news article cited a range of laid-off staff, the stated minimum and maximum were recorded. For articles that provided an exact number or estimate of laid-off staff, the stated number was recorded as both the minimum and maximum. When only the maximum was mentioned (e.g., "up to 10"), the stated maximum was used and one was recorded as the minimum. Conversely, when only the minimum was mentioned (e.g., "at least 10"), the stated number was used as both the minimum and maximum. This was done to be as conservative as possible. The study relied on the estimated maximum number of layoffs for any individual outlet.

Acknowledgments

Assistance in data analysis was provided by Nami Sumida, Sophia Fedeli, Galen Stocking, Amy Shim and Hadeel Saab.